



Center for Strategic & Regional Studies
Kabul

Weekly Analysis- Issue Number 96 (December 13-20, 2014)

Weekly Analysis is one of the CSRS' publications, which significantly analyze weekly economic and political events in Afghanistan and the region. The prime motive behind this is to provide strategic insights and policy solutions to decision-making institutions and individuals in order to help them to design best policies. Weekly Analysis is published in local languages (Pashto and Dari) and international languages as well (English and Arabic languages).

In this issue:

- Preface 2

Analysis of the Report Published about CIA Torture

- Background and Research Methods of the Report 3
- Result and Findings of the Report..... 4
- Methods of CIA Torture..... 6
- The CIA tortures and Human Rights..... 7
- The U.S. in Battle with its own values..... 7

Violation of Human Rights by Human Rights Supporters

- Torture in the U.S Prisons..... 9
- Concealing More Terrible Crimes 10
- Memories of Former Prisoners..... 11
- Result of those Tortures over Global Security..... 12

Preface

In this volume of the weekly analysis of CSRS you will read about the torture of CIA that is published in a report by the U.S. congress, which is analyzed by the analytical board of CSRS.

A few days ago, the intelligence commission of the U.S. congress published a report, in which the torture of prisoners by CIA was discussed.

According to the U.S. Senate published report, CIA was torturing the suspected prisoners in such a way that was not only against human rights, but also against the U.S. interest, which count itself as the supporter of human rights and based on that the U.S. deal with other countries.

In what way were those prisoners tortured by CIA? What was the result of those tortures, and, in fact, what happened in the U.S. prisons? These are the topics that would be discussed in the details of this analysis:

Analysis of the report published about CIA torture



The U.S. Senate Selected Commission on Intelligence¹ report about the questioning and torture of the prisoners, which is mainly called report of torture of prisoners by CIA, is written in 6,000 pages. The Chairperson of the commission Dianne Feinstein² published the summary of the report from the beginning to the end of the report in 525 pages³. And made it non-confidential.

As they did not publish the rest of the 6,000 pages of the report, it seems that the torture of CIA are more than what are published in the small piece of report that is published; still the small summary of the report has the parts that brought black spots on the human rights claims of the U.S. in the international community.

Background and Research Method of the Report:

As on September 11th 2001, the World Trade Center, in New York City, attacked by Al Qaida Network, by publishing a decree⁴ on September 17th 2001 the U.S. President of the time George W. Bush allowed CIA for torturing the prisoners. And after that the torture and questioning program of CIA began.

¹United States Senate Select Committee on Intelligence

²Dianne Feinstein, Chairman Senate Select Committee on Intelligence

³The preface of Dianne Feinstein in the report is 6 pages, result and findings of the report is 19 pages, and the rest of 499 pages are all the summary of the report, which overall it is 525 pages.

⁴Memorandum of notification (MON)

Based on the mentioned program, there were 113 people tortured till 2004, later on 4 people in 2005, one person in 2006, and one other was tortured in 2007, so overall there were 119 people tortured up to 2007.

The latest torture of the mentioned program of CIA was done on November 8th 2007, and in April 2008 CIA did not have any person for torture; therefore, the report of the Senate claims that the torture program of CIA stopped in 2007. But still it is not clear either the U.S. Forces still use those inhumane and cruel torture for gaining information, or not?

The Commission of the U.S. Senate started research about torture and questioning program of CIA in March of 2009; and according to the chairperson of the commission, the foundation of the research was based on the videos that were published related to the torture of prisoners by CIA in 2007⁵.

Overall, the report discusses the torture of prisoners by CIA since the incident of 9/11 to 2006, and it is supported by 2794 references.

The officials of the commission, since the beginning of 2009 to the end of 2012, collected more than 6 million data sources about the torture of CIA in prisons, the data sources includes; operational and intelligence reports, internal dairies and emails, information of meetings, texts of interviews, contracts and so on. So after analysis of the data the commission prepared the report. Overall, the report is written based on primary sources, which most of those were confidential information.

The first draft of the research was written in October of 2011, and on December 13th 2012 the research was completed. On 3rd April 2014, the Senate Selected Commission of Intelligence decided to send the result and findings of the research with its summary to the U.S. president, so president will order publication of the mentioned confidential research to be exposed. So later on, it will be available for everyone.

Result and Findings of the Report:

The result and finding of the mentioned report is written in 19 pages, which are, overall, 20 findings that are mentioned as below:

1. The CIA's use of its enhanced interrogation techniques was not an effective means of acquiring intelligence or gaining cooperation from detainees.

⁵The preface of the Chairperson of the U.S. Senate Selected Commission on Intelligence Dianne Feinstein: first page.

2. The CIA's justification for the use of its enhanced interrogation techniques rested on inaccurate claims of their effectiveness.
3. The interrogations of CIA detainees were brutal and far worse than the CIA represented to policymakers and others.
4. The conditions of confinement for CIA detainees were harsher than the CIA had represented to policymakers and others.
5. The CIA repeatedly provided inaccurate information to the Department of Justice (DOJ), impeding a proper legal analysis of the CIA's Detention and Interrogation Program.
6. The CIA has actively avoided or impeded congressional oversight of the program.
7. The CIA impeded effective White House oversight and decision-making.
8. The CIA's operation and management of the program complicated, and in some cases impeded, the national security missions of other Executive Branch agencies.
9. The CIA impeded oversight by the CIA's Office of Inspector General.
10. The CIA coordinated the release of classified information to the media, including inaccurate information concerning the effectiveness of the CIA's enhanced interrogation techniques.
11. The CIA was unprepared as it began operating its Detention and Interrogation Program more than six months after being granted detention authorities.
12. The CIA's management and operation of its Detention and Interrogation Program was deeply flawed throughout the program's duration, particularly so in 2002 and early 2003.
13. Two contract psychologists devised the CIA's enhanced interrogation techniques and played a central role in the operation, assessments, and management of the CIA's Detention and Interrogation Program. By 2005, the CIA had overwhelmingly outsourced operations related to the program.
14. CIA detainees were subjected to coercive interrogation techniques that had not been approved by the Department of Justice or had not been authorized by CIA Headquarters.
15. The CIA did not conduct a comprehensive or accurate accounting of the number of individuals it detained, and held individuals who did not meet the legal standard for

detention. The CIA's claims about the number of detainees held and subjected to its enhanced interrogation techniques were inaccurate.

16. The CIA failed to adequately evaluate the effectiveness of its enhanced interrogation techniques.
17. The CIA rarely reprimanded or held personnel accountable for serious or significant violations, inappropriate activities, and systematic and individual management failures.
18. The CIA marginalized and ignored numerous internal critiques, criticisms, and objections concerning the operation and management of the CIA's Detention and Interrogation Program.
19. The CIA's Detention and Interrogation Program was inherently unsustainable and had effectively ended by 2006 due to unauthorized press disclosures, reduced cooperation from other nations, and legal and oversight concerns.
20. The CIA's Detention and Interrogation Program damaged the United States' standing in the world, and resulted in other significant monetary and non-monetary costs^{6 7}.

Methods of CIA Torture:

The first person that was tortured by CIA was Abu Zubaida, who was arrested by Pakistan Army and submitted to the U.S., it is said that the U.S. Forces kept him in Bagram Prison. The CIA methods of torture was practiced on him every week, even every day. They were slapping him, binding him to wall, giving him insomnia, and baring him.

One of the methods of CIA torture was waterboarding⁸ technic, which was physically very harmful. According to the report, Abo Zubaida would become unconscious and droplets would come out of his mouth. According to the internal records of CIA, Khalid Sheikh Mohammad reached the state of real water drowning⁹.

⁶Read the Committee Study of the Central Intelligence Agency's Detention and Interrogation Program (Pages: 9-25)

⁷Based on the report of the Senate, the U.S. spent 300 million dollars on the program and it resulted the destruction of the U.S. relations with its alliances.

⁸One of the methods of torturing the prisoners was that they would lay down the prisoner on a board, the prisoner's foot would be higher than his head (feet and hands would be banded to the same board) and they would pure water on the breathing area of the prisoner continuously, as the result of which the prisoner would feel as being sink in water, that is why this method of torture is called waterboarding.

⁹The report referred to a related email about this, but still the email is not exposed that from whom was it sent and who was the receiver of the email. Read about it:

Committee study of the Central Intelligence Agency's Detention and Interrogation Program (Pp: 10-25)

Another type of torture was insomnia, which a prisoner would be kept in insomnia up to 180 hours, sometimes they would kept then standing, or sometimes their hands would be tied above their heads. Other types of tortures were; standing them in cold water, standing them with broken bones for many hours, raping them, and other inhumane and cruel types of torture.

As the Americans think that since 2012 up to now seven prisoners committed suicide because of the tortures; but still it is not clear either those prisoners committed suicide, or they were martyred by Americans? An Afghan Prisoner by the name of Gul Rahman was also killed by the tortures of the Americans in 2012.

The CIA tortures and Human Rights:

Based on the first article of the UN convention against torture and other cruel, inhuman or degrading treatment or punishment¹⁰, punishment is defined as physical or/and mental pain that third party use it for the purpose of obtaining information. Based on the second article of the convention, all the judiciary, executive and administrative institutions prevent such tortures.

Overall, we can say that the two main purposes of the convention are; firstly preventing tortures, and secondly, the ones that torture should be punished.

Based on the mentioned convention of the UN, which the U.S. also signed it as many other countries and approved it in 1994, the U.S. violated human rights, prisoners' rights, and the UN international convention, and those that were involved in those inhuman and cruel torture should be punished¹¹.

The U.S. in Battle with its own values:

The U.S. media and most of the U.S. officials claim that democracy, human rights, respect to the sovereignty of others, moral values, and other values are the values of their country; but to what extent is the U.S. truthful about its mentioned values? If we only point out the U.S. activities in last one decade, we will see such an image of the U.S. that its activities are against its values, if it really has any values.

¹⁰Convention against torture and other cruel, inhuman or degrading treatment or punishment

¹¹The UN also raised its voice that those who are involved in the torturing and questioning program of CIA should be punished. Read the report of the UN in the website of human rights that is in the below link:

<http://www.hrw.org/news/2014/12/13/cia-torturers-should-be-prosecuted>

On one hand, the U.S. shout the slogan of democracy and use it against those that are risk for their interests; the blame Russia, China, North Korea, and Iran that they do not implement democracy in their countries, but on the other hand, it supports the military coup de ta against the elected president of Egypt.

Though, on one hand, the U.S. says that the intervention of Russia in Ukraine in against the independency of Ukraine, on the other hand, it invaded Afghanistan and Iraq at the beginning of twenty first century, and during the Arab Spring it militarily intervened in Libya and other countries. Wasn't those interventions against the national sovereignty and independency of those countries?

On one hand, the U.S. shouts the slogan of democracy and blame North Korea, Iran, Russia, China, and other Muslim countries for that, on the other hand, they have done those inhuman and cruel activities in Abu Ghuraib, Bagram, and Guantanamo Prisons which would be dishonor for it for many centuries. It is crystal clear for the international community that the U.S. does not have any values, or it has a political aspect.

Violation of Human Rights by Human Rights Supporters



“I can’t breathe” is the expression that reached mouths of most of the political opponents in the U.S. with regard to the racial segregation, which refers to how the police killed a black man. The black man, Eric Garner, was suffocated and killed by police while shouting “I cannot breathe”. Though, media tries to show that only the police are involved in racial segregation, but the investigation of court of the victim shows that only police are not involved in it, but also segregation of the minority groups in the U.S. is in the nature of the U.S. System.

The U.S. is the country that claims they are main supporters of human rights around the world, and due to the mentioned reasons it criticizes other countries around the world, but protests against racism, in huge cities and areas of the U.S., shows the internal facts of the community of the U.S.

Torture in the U.S Prisons

The last report of the U.S. congress, which is the highest legislative branch of the U.S., is the formal confession of the U.S. about violation of human rights by that country. But what is mentioned in the report is an attempt to hide the terrible facts of the crimes of CIA that they do in the Guantanamo and other prisons in the U.S. On one hand it is tried to confess about the torture in the prisons like; slapping, insulting, smashing of the criminals to walls, keeping the prisoners naked in cold weather, keeping them in insomnia for long time, and artificial immerse of prisoners in water that impedes breathing; on the other hand, it wants to hide that the mentioned torture and others like the one of Eric Garner are related to some small groups, not the policy of the U.S. Government.

Concealing More Terrible Crimes:

Anything that we heard from the report is not new, most of those words and crimes were heard from the mouths of the prisoners that were released from the Guantanamo Prison, and there were even pictures and videos of such crimes published. But formal publication of these terrible crimes creates many questions.

In the report that is published, there is no sign visible about suicides that the prisoners have committed; the prisoners that committed suicide were mental suppressed to the extent that they committed suicide, and later on the CIA officials said that their suicides were also conspiracies against the U.S.!

On June 11th 2006, some media reported that three prisoners in Guantanamo Prison committed suicide. In 2007, Associated Press reported that a prisoner in the Guantanamo Prison attempted ten times to commit suicide, but other prisoners prevented him from suicide. Due to the uncertainty of his future, he is hopeful that one day he will be able to commit suicide.

The mentioned 33 year-old prisoner, by the name of Juma Mohammad Aldesari, wrote in the report that was published by the news agency, "Here we face the worst form of brutality and physical violence".

Up to 2012, there were, at least, 7 prisoners who committed suicide in Guantanamo Prison, which the seventh one of them was 32 years old Adnan Abdul Latif from Yemen, which after three months the U.S. officials declared that the reason of his death was suicide, and the lawyer of Abdul Latif said that Abdul Latif was died because of massive use drugs, and in a prison that has extreme control, it is not possible that he would do so by himself. He was suffering from shortness of breath, but there was no doctor to take care of him, and he was left in his cage, and same as Eric Garner "He could not breathe".

Most likely, Abdul Latif was annoying to the prisoners and they also preferred to kill him, with attention to his death, his lawyer claimed that his client was killed by the U.S. officials in such a way that they did not leave any sign to be captured. He spent 11 years in the Guantanamo Prison without finding any proof against him that will show him criminal.

A review to the report explains that the report is going to publish small incidents, compared to crucial torture, that occur inside the Guantanamo Prison to conceal the brutal tortures that take place in the prison. For example, the prisoners that are released from the prison explains that there is a separate building for the ones that are mentally disordered. Sometimes they send other prisoners to the same building to the mentally disordered prisoners to torture him by insomnia. There is nothing mentioned about the extreme hunger that the prisoners suffered from in the prison.

Memories of Former Prisoners:

Two of the Afghan Prisoners in Guantanamo Prison, Abdul Rahim Muslim Dost and Mullah Abdul Salaam Zaef published their memories of the prison after their release.

Mullah Abdul Salaam Zaef, who was earlier imprisoned in Guantanamo Prison, published his book "Tasweere az Guantanamo" which means "An Image from Guantanamo" and he briefly narrated physical and mental torture in the prison as below:

1. Lack of law and rule.
2. Tortures that were against humanity and that were totally useless.
3. Violence of soldiers.
4. Uncertainty of the future of the prisoners.
5. Long-term imprisonment of the prisoners in individual cabins.
6. Insulting religions sanctities like Holly Quran.
7. Not letting the prisoners to study, and lack of any activity to keep the prisoner busy that would cause the prisoner to think all the time and be concerned.
8. Long-term insomnia, which would even take months and would cause the prisoner mental illness and mental disorder.
9. Humiliating torture as baring the prisoners.
10. Giving inappropriate information about the families of the prisoners through fake news to cause them mental disorder.
11. They would not treat the prisoners that were sick, so they would be always concerned about their health.
12. Delaying the letters of the families of the prisoners to the prisoners and omitting some parts of the letters, so the prisoners would be concerned about their families.

Result of those Tortures over Global Security:

Congress blames the CIA for giving inappropriate insurance of their activities to the U.S. Government, and says that torture of prisoners did not help in decrease of terrorism at all. The information that was gained from prisoners was not true, and they narrated fake stories because of saving themselves from pain and torture.

But the report did not point that why those released prisoners became against the U.S, who even want to take revenge from the U.S. even with the cost of their life. For example, before being imprisoned by CIA, Abdul Rahim Muslim Dost did not have any relationships with Al Qaida and the Taliban, and he was a small business person who was selling soap in Peshawar of Pakistan, and in extra time he was translating and writing books and articles.

But the same person, after his release from the Guantanamo Prison, is once again followed by the U.S., because he is currently representative of one of the fundamental Islamic Group known as the Islamic State, which is led by Abu Baker Baghdadi, in Northern Asia. So, is torture in the U.S. prison the reason for creating a brighter future for us?

The End

Contact Us:

Email: info@csrskabul.com - csrskabul@gmail.com

Website: www.csrskabul.com

Contact: **(+93) 784089590**

